Actors, Contents and Practices of Transmission in Family and Social Contexts

Third General DYNTRAN Workshop
www.dyntran.hypotheses.org

3-4 April 2017
Università di Napoli “L’Orientale”, Naples
Workshop participants

Naofumi Abe  
*University of Tokyo*

Sacha Alsancakli  
*Université Sorbonne Nouvelle/“Mondes iranien et indien”*

Sandra Aube  
*CNRS “Mondes iranien et indien”*

Michele Bernardini  
*Università di Napoli “L’Orientale”*

Giancarlo Casale  
*University of Minnesota*

Roberta Denaro  
*Università di Napoli “L’Orientale”*

Juliette Dumas  
*Aix-Marseille Université*

Albrecht Fuess  
*Philipps-Universität Marburg*

Nicolas Michel  
*Aix-Marseille Université*

Anthony T. Quickel  
*Philipps-Universität Marburg/Aix-Marseille Université*

Francis Richard  
*BULAC/“Mondes iranien et indien”*

Maria Szuppe  
*CNRS “Mondes iranien et indien”*

Alberto Tiburcio Urquiola  
*Philipps-Universität Marburg*

Natalia L. Tornesello  
*Università di Napoli “L’Orientale”*

Tommaso Trevisani  
*Università di Napoli “L’Orientale”*

Christoph Werner  
*Philipps-Universität Marburg*

Torsten Wollina  
*Orient Institut Beirut*

Daniel Zakrzewski  
*Philipps-Universität Marburg*

Organizing team:

Convenor: Michele Bernardini  
Organizing team: Michele Bernardini, Maria Szuppe, Christoph Werner, Sandra Aube and Alberto Tiburcio Urquiola
ABSTRACTS

Naofumi Abe  (University of Tokyo)
A Tabrizi Notable Family and Family Property: The Case of Najafqoli Khān Donboli and his Descendants in Eighteenth and Nineteenth Century Iran

This study investigates the continuity of family property and the change of its characteristics within decades, focusing on a Tabrizi notable family, Najafqoli Khān Donboli and his descendants in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

In the history of Iran, the local notable families have been studied through the analysis of narrative sources, namely local histories and biographies. Some of those families were in charge of local administration and some others became religio-juridical authorities. These notable families, who were landlords as well, sometimes continued for centuries regardless of the rise and fall of the central authorities. Some researchers regard this continuity as a crucial element in Iranian local society. On the other hand, other scholars pointed out that the emergence of landed notables who could transmit their estate stably for generations was prevented. One of those reasons is the Islamic inheritance law. A great gap is perceivable between these two arguments related to the continuity of Iranian notables.

Research in local notables from the socio-economic historical aspect has started from Werner’s An Iranian Town in Transition, 2000, which elucidates the change in the power structure in the city of Tabriz from the eighteenth to the middle of the nineteenth century. Although Werner’s study and Kondo’s explores the development of elite family’s waqf endowments during the above period, the transmission of wealth across generations still remains understudied dimension in the history of Iran. Thus we need to consider the transference of notable’s property through Islamic inheritance system in a long period of time.

Based on archival materials, first, I examine the socio-economic activity of Najafqoli Khān Donboli in Tabriz, and then, consider the change in family property during four generations, Najafqoli Khān, Khodādād Khān, Fāṭḥ-‘Alī Beg, and Boyūk Khān. Lastly the speaker points out the strategy of transfer of the family property which was introduced since third generation. This analysis shall be a valuable example for better understanding of notable families and conditions of their continuity in the context of history of Iran.

utsusemi1977@hotmail.com

Sacha Alsancakli  (Université Sorbonne Nouvelle/"Mondes iranien et indien")
The Role of Copyists in the Transmission of Manuscripts: A Case Study on Šaraf Xān Bidlīs’ī’s Šarafnāma (1005-1314/1597-1897)

The Šarafnāma is a well-known history of Kurdish dynasties and ruling houses, written in Persian in 1005-7/1596-99 by Amir Šaraf Xān Bidlīsī (949-1009/1543-1600), leader of the Rōjiki tribe and prince of Bidlis, southwest of Lake Van, in northern Kurdistan. In the course of my study of the Šarafnāma, I have worked with 36 different manuscripts of the text, covering a time period going from its composition (1005/1597) to the end of the 13th/19th century. This work, focused on the processes of composition, transmission and reception of the text, has led me to question the role played by copyists in these processes. In this preliminary article, I will share a few remarks on the ways in which, through three centuries of manuscript transmission, copyists have relayed and interpreted the text of the Šarafnāma according to cultural context, political necessity and/or professional choices.
sacha.alsancakli@gmail.com
Sandra Aube (CNRS/“Mondes iranien et indien”)

Lineages of Craftsmen: Mobility and Transmission of Skills in the Architecture of Mazanderan during the Mar’ashi Dynasty

Signatures of craftsmen are very limited in Medieval Iranian architecture. Architects, designers, tile cutters, woodcarvers are mostly anonymous. In this framework, the region of Mazanderan constitutes an interesting exception. My work-in-progress led me to constitute a corpus of nearly fifty tomb-towers dated to the Mar’ashi period (c. 760/1359-second half of the 16th century) in the Mazanderan. This survey illustrates the very local style of this architecture. It also brings to light a group of uncommon wooden piece of works (doors, tombs, etc.). Among the half of these tomb-towers have kept signatures of craftsmen. A large part belongs to woodcarvers: a corporation that is quite bad known for this period.

This lecture aims to present this work-in-progress by exploring the role of families or lineages of craftsmen in the transmission of skills and in the definition of a regional style.

sandra.aube@yahoo.fr

Giancarlo Casale (University of Minnesota)

Traveling Obelisks, Traveling Scholars, and the Celalzade Family of Istanbul

In 1541, the scholar Salih Celalzade, younger brother of the Ottoman Grand Chancellor Mustafa Celalzade, was ordered to leave his teaching job at the Sultan Bayezid Madrasa and travel to Egypt on an official assignment. Although questions of high politics and court intrigue necessitated the trip, an unintended consequence for Celalzade was the composition of his Tarih-i Misr al-Cedid, a remarkable work about the antiquities, history, and material culture of pre-Islamic Egypt, based in part on texts collected during his time abroad and in part on his own personal experiences. This paper will explore one particularly compelling aspect of Celalzade’s writing about Egypt –its obelisks and their connection to the history and material landscape of Celalzade’s native Istanbul– against the background of the political program and court connections of Celalzade’s illustrious older brother Mustafa.

casale@umn.edu

Juliette Dumas (Aix-Marseille Université)

La noblesse dans le titre ? Les noms de famille en -zâde à l’époque moderne ottomane

Le système nominal ottoman fait grand cas des formules créées par l’annexion persane -zâde : fils, descendant de. Dans ma présentation précédente, j’avais avancé l’hypothèse de l’existence d’une notion de noblesse attachée à cette forme nominale, dans le cas précis des noms de famille (patronymes, voire matronymes) construits par l’association d’un titre à cette forme en -zâde (par exemple : Pachazade, Beyzade, Sultanzade). J’entends maintenant approfondir cette hypothèse par des recherches dans les sources ottomanes, en vue d’analyser les usages de cette forme spécifique de noms de famille. Concrètement, il s’agira de voir qui utilise cette combinaison comme nom de famille, afin de répondre à la question : de quoi ces noms de famille sont-ils porteurs ? Sont-ils l’expression d’une marque d’appartenance nobiliaire et, dans ce cas, comment la définir ?

dumas.ju@gmail.com
Increasing Wealth, Power, or Offspring? What Purpose is served most by Marriage at the Mamluk Court?

As has been established in the course of the previous Dyntran workshops marriage in the Mamluk Empire of the 15th century between new sultans and their wives are usually concluded after the death of the old sultan in order to secure the claim to power and to transmit authority. What is unclear however is what else was transmitted?

Do we know about dowry arrangements or inheritance questions? How were the new in-laws incorporated into family networks and what was there exact legal status. Was the reason of the marriage to produce offspring or was this of secondary nature for the Mamluk court as the sultanship was not transmitted from father to son in the Mamluk Empire of the 15th century. The planned contribution will try to deepen our understanding of what exactly is transmitted in royal marriages and will also try to examine if the “what” is totally different in the royal context compared to the rest of the nobility or if they follow similar patterns.

Anthony T. Quickel (Philipps-Universität Marburg/Aix-Marseille Université)

Buying Books in Mamluk and Ottoman Cairo

Fundamental to my ongoing research interests in the DYNTRAN Project are the books that were owned by the merchant class of early Ottoman Cairo. While some of these books, their numbers, and varieties are known from the probate court registers, there is little scholarship thus far on the markets from which the books themselves were purchased. These markets were an important part of the cultural and scholastic life of the Mamluk and Ottoman city. The interplay between the markets, the city’s mosques and institutions of learning, and the market for paper has yet to be explored within the Cairene context. Furthermore, scholarship on the activities and life of the book markets themselves is also lacking. Therefore, this paper hopes to begin to explore the Mamluk and Ottoman book markets and to understand their role within the social and cultural life of the city. This, in turn, will better contribute to my larger DYNTRAN research project as it relates to completing our understanding regarding the nature and process of book ownership generally.

Francis Richard (BULAC/“Mondes iranien et indien”)

Dans l’univers lettré du monde iranien, comment la transmission se fait-elle ?

Il est difficile de connaître les modes de transmission qui ont abouti à la sauvegarde de nombre de textes, altérés ou non. Si on identifie les lieux de savoir que furent les grandes madrasah, les cercles lettrés de la cour ou certaines bibliothèques, le choix des textes étudiés et transmis, la manière de les transmettre et la formation de ceux qui les transmettent restent encore très mal connus. Une modeste collecte de témoignages et d’indices peut fournir quelques pistes de recherche. Le respect porté au livre est fruit d’une longue tradition et revêt des formes multiples dans le monde iranien. Quelques biographies de lettrés ou de savants peuvent être utiles pour mesurer la place du maître ou de l’exercice individuel. La codicologie et l’histoire de la circulation des manuscrits nous fournissent de très nombreux renseignements. Secrétaires (monsbi) et copistes jouent un rôle social dont l’ampleur est à évaluer selon les lieux et époques.

5
Maria Szuppe (CNRS/“Mondes iranien et indien”)
A Family or/and a Workshop? Tracing a Group of Calligraphers between Samarkand and Bukhara at the Turn of the 17th Century

The analysis of five manuscripts of the Persian Shāhnāma epics produced in Samarkand within a short period of five years (1600-1604) transcribed by two calligraphers, who at least once worked in collaboration, opens up an interesting field of investigation. Each of these calligraphers, Ādīna Bukhārī (fl. 1595-1605) and Mīr Māh b. Mīr ‘Arab (fl. 1592-1613), also copied other literary texts in Persian. The latter copyist was a family relation of a renowned court calligrapher of the Shibanid rulers of Bukhara, Mīr Kulangi (fl. ca. 1535-1585) who was himself also specialized in the copy of Persian classical literature; more then 30 manuscripts by his hand are extant today. The present talk will touch upon the issues of the actual organization and practices of manuscript transmission, aspects of specialization (authors, texts, subjects), and the importance of family and professional reference figure.

Alberto Tiburcio Urquiola (Philipps-Universität Marburg)
The Nature of ‘Alī Qulī Jadīd al-Islām’s Response to Jerome Xavier: A Question of Sources

During my last presentation in Cairo in November 2016 I introduced the cycle of debates dating back to Jerome Xavier’s polemic against Islam at the Mughal court and culminating with the response of ‘Alī Qulī Jadīd al-Islām at the court of Shāh Sulṭān Ḥusain in late Safavid Iran. In this occasion I would like to follow up with this line of research by further exploring the question of what sources our authors where using as tools for their own treatises and translation commentaries. By this I mean mostly what Bibles they were using for their commentaries, but also the familiarity their work reveals regarding the broader scholarly traditions they were engaging. This exploration will inexorably rely on a certain degree of speculation based on what the texts themselves suggest and based on what their prefaces reveal. This should help us pave the way towards elucidating the readership and circulation of these texts as well as the nature of the sponsorship behind them.

Christoph Werner (Philipps-Universität Marburg)
Actors of Transmission: Poets and Panegyrists in 14th and 15th century Azerbaijan

Following up on the intimate connection between the Kujuji family and the Jalayirid dynasty as expressed through panegyric poetry in the DYNTRAN-Workshop in Cairo (November 2016), in this presentation I will widen the scope and see what other (families of) poets were close to the respective rulers of Azerbaijan during the 14th and 15th century. In addition to the divan by Ghiyāth al-Dīn Kujuji, now available in a criticial edition, I will also relate to Taqī al-Dīn Kāshānī’s Khulaṣat al-ash’ār and other anthologies.
Practices of transmission of knowledge can be roughly clustered under two distinct, albeit interdependent, headings: Reproduction and preservation (boundaries between the two are even more blurred in oral transmission). Reproduction was achieved through teaching (including creation of students’ copies), commercial copying, note-taking, and citation and discussion in other works (e.g. in/of biographical works or the sharḥ and mukhtar genres). Preservation, as I understand it, includes practices of book collection (libraries), book compilation (binding in majāmi’), restoration, and, arguably, indexing and catalogization. On one hand, the collection of books (and, on a smaller scale, their compilation) enabled their written transmission, in particular, while, on the other, copying damaged parts of books would often be the only applicable way of restoration. Yet, exceptional success in the preservation of certain books could also result in diminished reproduction efforts (especially full copying).

Based on these considerations, this contribution examines the corpus of the 16th-century Damascene scholar Muḥammad Ibn Ṭūlūn (d. 955/1548), which includes large books (of sometimes several volumes) as well as miscellaneous writings, and trajectories of their transmission between the 16th and 18th centuries. In particular, it will address the aspects of collection, compilation, indexing and catalogization, and how they contributed to the large-scale survival of Ibn Ṭūlūn’s autograph corpus and, at the same time, inhibited efforts of reproduction. Since Ibn Ṭūlūn’s audience was mostly local, demand was satisfied by the autograph copies available in his endowed library, access to which he eased both through a work list and index pages in individual multiple text manuscripts.

The paper will introduce the Malikān family of Tabriz that is best documented in the period between the late 12th and early 14th but persisted into the 16th century. In that earlier period, family members mainly served as government officials in the city and at successive courts based there some playing prominent roles in the establishment of Mongol rule in Iran.

But the Malikān not only transmitted political influence within the family across several generations in a social context of partly tremendous changes. Individual members also enabled transmissions in other domains providing for the construction and upkeep of madrasas in pre-Mongol and Mongol Tabriz, patronizing pious Persian poetry or both. A couple composed verses themselves and at least one authored treteases and copied literary, scientific and religious works of himself, relatives and others into a portable library.

All in all, the Malikān can be characterized as aristocrats who managed to maintain positions of social distinction in Tabriz during a highly agitated period of time. As such they helped preserve and reshape political and cultural traditions reflecting a dynamic awareness of local excellence in which their family and city remained focal points of overlapping and enlarging frames of reference.